

REPORT

FOURTH INTERNATIONAL COORDINATION MEETING OF THE EASTERN SOUTH PACIFIC SOUTHERN RIGHT WHALE CONSERVATION MANAGEMENT PLAN INTERNATIONAL WHALING COMMISSION Lima - Peru, October 05th, 2022

1. Welcome

Ambassador Augusto Arzubiaga, General Director of Sovereignty, Limits and Antarctic Affairs of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Peru, welcomed the participants to the IV CMP Coordination Meeting, which was the first in-person meeting after 3 years due to the pandemic. The meeting was aimed to conduct the 6-year review of the CMP and coordinate future steps. Ambassador Arzubiaga highlighted the importance of the CMP and the great advances made between Range States for the conservation of this Critically Endangered population. He also informed CMP participants about the death of Ms. Marcela Zamorano, representative of General Directorate of Maritime Territory and Merchant Marine from the Chilean Navy that was an active member of the CMP Steering Committee and called for a moment of silence to honor her valuable contributions to whale conservation.

The meeting was attended by the Commissioner of Chile to the International Whaling Commission (IWC), representatives of the Undersecretariat of Fisheries and Aquaculture of Chile (SUBPESCA), and the National Fisheries and Aquaculture Service of Chile (SERNAPESCA). Peru was represented by the Commissioner of Peru to the IWC and representatives of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Peruvian Institute of the Sea (IMARPE), the Ministry of Production, the Ministry of the Environment, and the General Directorate of Captaincies and Coastguards (DICAPI) of the Peruvian Navy. Barbara Galletti participated as CMP coordinator and Robert L. Brownell Jr. participated as coordinator of the CMP sub-committee of the IWC Scientific Committee. Miguel Iñíguez, Alternate Commissioner of Argentina to the IWC, and Cristina Castro, director of the Pacific Whale Foundation of Ecuador, also participated. The list of participants can be found in Annex 1.

2. Appointment of chair and rapporteur

Bárbara Galletti was appointed as chair and Elisa Goya as rapporteur.

3. Review and adoption of the agenda

The agenda was reviewed and adopted (Annex 2).

4. Progress on short-term priority actions since 2016

Considering that not all participants were present at the previous three coordination meetings, Galletti gave a brief overview of the Eastern South Pacific Southern Right Whale (ESP SRW) Conservation Management Plan (CMP) and its six-year review objectives and procedures. ESP SRW are distributed along the coast of Chile and Peru and are currently classified as Critically Endangered by the IUCN. This has led the IWC to adopt a CMP for this population in 2012 and in 2016, Peru was welcomed as second Range State at the CMP and a revised CMP was adopted.

The overall objective of the ESP SRW CMP is “*to guide and encourage range state stakeholders (i.e. government, industry, coastal communities and civil society, among others) and international partners to take steps towards the recovery of this population to levels that will allow the species to withstand both environmental and anthropogenic impacts and ensure its long-term survival*”. She also described the threats that have been identified under the 2016 CMP and the priority actions that have been conducted. It was highlighted the importance of a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) to coordinate cooperation for the conservation of SRW that was signed by Chile and Peru in 2018, extending the CMP beyond the scope of the IWC.

Activities undertaken under the CMP over the past six years were summarized and they included inter alia, the ongoing passive acoustic monitoring program, the stranding response to 2017 dead whale, the multinational training workshop on disentanglement and stranding response in 2018, the increasing efforts to record sightings and collect photo-ID data, the first genetic analyses, the virtual expert workshop for the 6-year review in 2022, the experience exchange workshop on whale watching and research permits in 2022, four CMP coordination meetings along these years and the implementation of several public awareness and environmental educational actions.

During discussions, it was noted the extensive amount of work and progress made over the past six years and the benefits the CMP and MoU have provided to enhance coordination among Range States for the conservation of this Critically Endangered population. It was also discussed the upcoming participation of a peruvian expert in maintenance activities of the hydrophone in northern Chile, between November 2022 and January 2023, to create capacities for monitoring next site along the peruvian coast. It was confirmed that funds for the participation of peruvian experts and the field work to implement passive acoustic monitoring in peruvian waters were secured and that coordination to select the location site needed to begin as soon as possible. It was also noted that there was also an offer of additional equipment to be used simultaneously in Golfo de Penas, southern Chile, but further discussions on logistics were needed to ensure support of vessel time from Chilean Navy. In response to a question, it was informed that the photo-ID catalogue included any useful photo, either from side views or aerial views and included about 40 individuals back to 1980's with only one recapture reported. Finally, it was highlighted the value and need to continue conducting new training workshops on disentanglement and stranding response to increase capacities in both countries (IMARPE and SERNAPESCA). Dr. Castro also provided information about a new sighting in Ecuador, being the northernmost reported sighting and first record in water of Ecuador.

5. Outcomes of the “Virtual Expert Workshop on the 6-year review of the ESP SRW CMP”

Galletti presented the outcomes of the virtual expert workshop on the 6-year review of the ESP SRW CMP that was conducted in August 2022. The expert workshop represents a critical part of this six-year review and was aimed to a) review historical and recent data on Chile-Peru southern right whales in order to inform and update the scientific information under the CMP and b) review and identify new short-term, medium-term and long-

term research, monitoring and mitigation actions. 26 experts from Chile, Peru, USA, Argentina, New Zealand and UK that have previous work on southern right whales attended the workshop.

Historical catches and distribution were discussed at the workshop, including the ongoing work to reconstruct whaling catches series for this population and several recommendations arose. It was highlighted the southern Chile area was a former whaling area and that mother-calf targeted by bay whaling could explain the difficulties for this population to show signs of recovery.

Population structure and genetic analyses were also presented and highlighted that the single sample from Chile-Peru had an mtDNA haplotype previously only observed in the Indo-Pacific and had a nuclear genotype that appeared admixed between the Indo-Pacific and South Atlantic. It was noted the importance of collecting biopsy samples for conducting these studies and discussed the possibility and values of sampling mother-calf pairs.

Recent distribution was also analyzed based on acoustic and sighting data. Information on the impact of noise from vessel traffic in southern Chile was also presented. Data provided important information about the range expansion in waters of Peru, a possible breeding area in northern Chile and highlighted the importance of southern Chile (Los Lagos and Aysen region) for possible breeding, calving and feeding activities for this species that also overlap with former whaling area. As there is no data on basic biology for this species, a summary of other populations was presented, such as calving interval, social behaviour and feeding ecology, and it is expected to be applicable also for this population.

There is also no data to estimate abundance and threats. During workshop discussion it was proposed to focus efforts in collecting photo-ID data as this could be more feasible and it was proposed to use new approaches to predict habitat of these rare whales using the opportunistic sightings. The workshop also reviewed the threats faced by this population and updated the risk assessment. Major concerns were raised by entanglement events recorded for this species, the potential collision with vessels in northern and southern Chile and the salmon farming impacts (entanglements, ship strikes and water pollution, among others) in southern Chile. In particular, great concern was expressed on the serious threat the current levels of salmon farming and its expected expansion poses to the whales in the region. It was highlighted that the salmon farming industry currently overlap with the main areas of historical catches and recent important data reported for Los Lagos and Aysen region.

It was reiterated that any anthropogenic mortality should be kept at zero. Finally, Galletti presented the updated risk assessment table and the associated priority actions for research, monitoring and mitigation that were developed during the workshop. In addition to what have already been identified under the 2016 CMP, some new priority actions have been identified and were proposed to be included.

During the meeting, the proposed actions from the expert workshop were reviewed and there was also a proposal to include on the table unregulated scientific research as a potential harassment risk for the whales. It was also noted that during the expert workshop it was proposed to consider options to collect biopsy samples from mother-calf pairs and the possibility to conduct satellite tag activities in the future. These research activities are currently forbidden on both range states for the species. This topic was also discussed at the workshop on experience exchange under research permits agenda item and is reported later. In addition, it was suggested that due to the unlikely feasibility to sample small population the most important activity should be to focus on photo-ID and to collect old samples from museums.

Finally, it was also discussed the possibility to include Ecuador in some of these actions due to the new sighting record. Since this was an unusual event, it was noted that most probably it was associated to current

environmental conditions such as unusual cold waters off Ecuador and may not represent a range expansion. As CMPs are living documents and can be modified at any time, it was suggested that priority should be given to increase knowledge on current Range States although the inclusion of Ecuador in the future could also be a possibility if sightings continue to be reported in these waters. It was proposed that the passive acoustic monitoring off waters of Ecuador, or near Ecuador, after monitoring waters off south-central Peru is completed, could be useful to better understand the presence of right whales in that area.

6. Outcomes and recommendations of the "Workshop on Experience Exchange on Whale Watching Regulations and Research Permits"

Goya presented the outcomes and recommendations of the "Workshop on Experience Exchange on Whale Watching Regulations and Research Permits" conducted on October 3rd – 4th, 2022 in Lima, Peru.

Within the scope of the Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) signed by Chile and Peru, which coordinates cooperation for the conservation of SRW, the exchange of experiences in management, national regulations, and information related to the population of the SRW are considered. Thus, at the II Coordination Meeting (2018), as part of the priority actions for the CMP, a workshop for the exchange of experiences between the institutions of Chile and Peru on regulatory aspects, national mechanisms, and the possibility of establishing consistent procedures along SRW distribution range was planned to be carried out in the period 2019-2020.

The purpose of the workshop was to learn about the status of national regulations and processes on whale watching tourism and research permits in Chile and Peru; and to exchange experiences and make synergies aiming at achieving homologous measures in both countries, resulting in the promotion of conservation actions for the ESP SRW. Twenty-four officials from Chile and Peru participated, including IWC representatives and special guests from Argentina and Ecuador. Being carried out in Lima, the workshop ensured the broad participation of Peruvian representatives from five national institutions with expertise in these issues.

On the first day, topics related to whale watching tourism were addressed. Iñiguez presented the general framework of the whale watching activity in Latin America, which has a growing trend in both the number of tour operators and observers. He highlighted the concept of responsible whale watching, which must be based on four pillars: socioeconomic, research, education and conservation.

Chile presented its regulatory framework which include the General Regulations for the Observation of Hydrobiological Mammals, Reptiles and Birds and the Cetacean Sighting Registry. A special case is considered for the SRW, where observation can only be carried out on land-based platforms; for that purpose, they have a contingency plan to control this special measure. The importance of knowing the short-term impacts of tourism on whale behavior was also mentioned, which is why monitoring the behavior of whales during sightings was recommended. In the case of Peru, a broader framework for regulating cetacean watching is still missing; at present, there is only one measure that regulates the minimum distances of approach to marine cetaceans, with special considerations for mother-calf pairs. Recently, a manual of good practices for the observation of marine fauna, including cetaceans has been delivered. Ongoing initiatives to regulate the observation of marine fauna were announced.

Castro presented the success stories and challenges of tourism and sightings in Ecuador, she outlined that the activity brings great economic benefits to the communities in which it is carried out, and that activities must be based on solidarity economy, with social and environmental commitment.

The recommendations included the need to legislate whale watching from the beginning, not only for the conservation of the species, but also to safeguard people involved in the activity. To accomplish this, the areas must be zoned, but this is achieved with preliminary research and close work with the operators. It was also recommended that there should be only one regulatory entity, to improve efficiency. In this regard, the case of Peru was mentioned, where there are many institutions with different levels of competence, which represents one of the greatest difficulties that prevent the regulation of this activity in Peru. Although the regulations of other countries can be taken as a reference, the characteristics of each place and the species involved must be

taken into account. The importance of promoting the transfer of skills to local actors was also highlighted, as well as reconciling the interests of the tourism industry and the conservation of species and ecosystems in order to achieve the sustainability of this activity. It was also recommended to consider a more general regulation regarding cetaceans, and then something more specific for species such as the SRW.

The second day of the workshop focused on research permit systems. Chile announced the procedures for the issuance of permits, processing requirements, for which they have terms for research permits request. For its part, Peru presented the procedures for issuing permits.

Brownell updated the procedures and permits framed within the MMPA in the US. Furthermore, he presented information on how stranding responses teams works in the U.S. Stranding responses have been carried out by trained and authorized individuals, highlighting the collaboration of the public and private entities.

As a result of the discussions emerged from the virtual expert workshop on the 6-year review of the ESP SRW CMP, it was recommended to address issues related to obtaining biopsy samples from mother-calf pairs and the possibility to undertake in the future satellite TAGs activities. Regarding biopsies, the benefits of obtaining genetic samples from pairs (mothers-calf) were highlighted, since they provide information on populations, structure, connectivity, stress and survival; and therefore, it is necessary to facilitate the process of obtaining samples for studies on right whales focused on understanding their ecology and population dynamics, as well as other aspects that contribute to design conservation measures. It was mentioned that for the authorities of both Chile and Peru, it would be very important to have a working document endorsed by the IWC Scientific Committee which includes the advice of experts for sampling protocols and information that supports the need to take mother-calf biopsies and justifies the issuance of permits.

Among the recommendations, it was suggested to avoid duplication in research in terms of objectives and study areas. Therefore, the responsible entity should arrange coordination between permit holders to ensure the health of animals and the ecosystem. Also, it is necessary to define criteria for the evaluation of research requests for southern right whales, based on the best available scientific information and the application of the precautionary principle. The need to have specific protocols that reconcile animal welfare with obtaining important information for its conservation was highlighted. On the other hand, it should be considered different types of permits: for research, photography and filming for documentaries; as well as case-by-case considerations in permit applications. Finally, it was recommended to make a call for researchers who have experience in taking biopsy samples so they can apply for specific research permits that could be used whenever an opportunistic sighting occurs.

Regarding satellite marking, it was recommended to analyze the possibility of carrying out this activity in the medium term, taking into account the precautionary principle.

On the topic of stranding response, both Chile and Peru agreed to jointly review their protocols for strandings response of cetaceans and develop a necropsy protocol with minimal information and sampling specifically for SRW to be comparable. It was recommended to establish a stranding response network in Peru and it would be useful to explore the agreement (Stranding Agreement) the US has with civil society and private organizations. It was also recommended to increase training on strandings and disentanglement response to have trained personnel and SERNAPESCA offered to contribute to such training.

Finally, it was agreed to establish a work plan that will be developed virtually between peer institutions, and invite researchers to the next virtual workshops to present new findings regarding the SRW.

The CMP steering committee thanked Goya for summarizing the workshop outcomes held just before the IV CMP meeting. It was noted that the workshop was extremely useful and provided an excellent opportunity to develop synergies between governmental institutions. It was highlighted that several new and additional priority actions and activities have been identified during the workshop and that these will be summarized in a priority actions table such as the one provided during the virtual expert workshop. Considering that the IWC68 biennial meeting in Portoroz, Slovenia was scheduled between 13-21 October, it was noted the lack of time to provide a workshop report for consideration at this meeting. In this sense, the CMP Steering Committee agreed to work

on the workshop report and its recommendations after IWC68 and submit its full report to the next IWC Scientific Committee and Conservation Committee meeting.

7. Review and update of CMP priority actions 2022-2028

During the meeting, the CMP Steering Committee reviewed information on CMP updates and priority actions identified over the past 6-year implementation process, the virtual expert workshop and the experience exchange workshop. It was noted that there was a considerable amount of new information that needed to be updated on the CMP document and that the priority actions 2022-2028 needed to be compiled and reviewed before any new revised CMP could be agreed. In this sense, the CMP Steering Committee noted that it would not be possible to submit a revised CMP to the next IWC68 that is taking place between 13-21 October due to the short time in between for consultations. Therefore, it was decided to 1) first receive the full report of the workshop on experience exchange on whale watching regulations and research permits, that should include a table with recommended actions, before the end of 2022; 2) update the CMP to include all new information and actions; 3) circulate it for comments and consultation at national levels and; 4) submit a revised CMP for 2023-2028 to the upcoming Scientific and Conservation Committee meetings to received their advice and modify it if necessary.

Peru informed that to advance in the process to make consistent regulations with those enforced in Chile, internal meetings between the Ministry of Production and IMARPE will be undertaken in order to modify the regulations on whale watching distances to allow only land-based platform observation. The reports from experience exchange workshop and this CMP meeting report will be used as background information.

Brownell reiterated that the most important activity should be to focus on strengthening the sighting network and reporting between Chile and Peru to collect photo-ID information to improve knowledge on SRW movements and connectivity. He also suggested to check on fishing net, in case of entanglements, to look for remaining pieces of skin that could be used on genetic analysis. Castro offered to contribute with an online reporting platform already developed by Pacific Whale Foundation that could be of help to improve sighting reporting and support many priority actions. Iñiguez also offered the possibility to use the Argentinean cooperation agreement (FOAR) to train specialists in the use of drones for assessment of SRW body health condition and biopsy sampling, as well as whale watching training. He recommended to discuss this possibility with the Argentinean Ambassador and IWC Commissioner during the next IWC68.

SERNAPESCA also proposed as new priority action to be considered to increase technical capacities in forensic diagnosis to determine cause of death on stranding events.

Finally, it was also proposed that once the CMP is updated with new scientific information, to share it with experts that contributed to the virtual expert workshop for consideration before it is submitted to IWC.

8. CMP Implementation Strategy 2023-2024

Over the years, there have been a series of activities considered to advance in the implementation of priority actions. In contrast, during the IV CMP coordination meeting, the Steering Committee was focused in advancing the 6-year review of the CMP. Therefore, it was agreed that for the implementation strategy 2023-2024 the work should focus on the most critical activities identified so far that could be implemented on the short term and spend more time to revise the other pending activities during the next V CMP coordination meeting.

In this sense, to complete the 6-year review of the CMP was highlighted as one of the most immediate priority for the 2023-2024 period.

Regarding the ongoing passive acoustic monitoring project, it was noted that there was needed to start involving Peruvian collaborators for acoustic analysis as well as start coordination to implement the acoustic project in Peru in April 2023. In this sense, it will be needed to select the location site, appoint a technical expert in charge of hydrophone deployment and work with DICAPI, or with Natural Protected Areas National Service if located inside a protected area, to get necessary permits. It was agreed to establish a working group during 2022 to advance these tasks. Another consideration will be the import, customs, and logistics to send the equipment to Peru. It was also noted the need to start coordination with Chilean Navy to plan the deployment in Golfo de Penas.

The conduction of new training workshops on disentanglement response was also highlighted as a priority, particularly in Peru, and Sernapesca offered help with future trainings and suggested to request IWC support for additional trainers and equipment.

Considering the importance of increasing sighting reports and collection of photo-ID data, it was also noted that there were several alternatives proposed such as using social networks (facebook, whatsapp, etc.) or specially designed websites, app, etc. that have been considered over the past and proposed at different instances. To improve efficiency of the efforts, it was agreed that a comparative analysis of advantages and disadvantages of using such platforms should be conducted so the CMP Steering Committee could decide where to focus their efforts.

Coordination meetings have also proved to be very effective and were also considered as critical activities to facilitate and oversee the implementation of the CMP.

In addition, it was agreed that exchange of information on WW as well as advancing on protocols to facilitate biopsy sampling of SRW (including development of technical documents and establishing working groups) were also priority for the next two years. It was also highlighted the value to translate the MoU to English and provide it for information to the IWC Secretariat and Commission, as this was adopted after IWC67 and there haven't been any in-person meeting since then.

In summary, over 2023-2024 the CMP Implementation Strategy will focus on:

- Complete 6-year review and adopt a new revised CMP
- Conduct V and VI coordination meetings
- Continue to implement the Passive Acoustic Monitoring Program
- Conduct additional training workshop on disentanglement response in Peru.
- Develop a scientific and technical document on recommendations and protocols for the collection of biopsy samples to be submitted to the Scientific Committee in order to get advice/endorsement.
- Provide advice from Chile to Peru on the development of whale watching regulations.
- Establish working groups on disentanglement and stranding response to ensure continual training on both countries.
- Evaluate advantages and disadvantages of different platforms to report sightings.
- Translation of MoU and submission to IWC

9. Coordination and funding

The virtual expert workshop report was already adopted and submitted to the IWC. The report on the workshop of experience exchange on whale watching and research permits will be adopted before the end of 2022 and will be presented to the next IWC Scientific and Conservation Committee.

It was agreed that the report of the IV CMP coordination meeting will be presented to the IWC68 biennial meeting in Portoroz, Slovenia to update on the advances made and present future steps. It was expressed that to ensure the CMP continuity and the implementation of the activities highlighted, coordination work and coordination meeting were essentials to the process.

To date, the Passive Acoustic Monitoring project has secured funds to implement field work in Peru and partially in Golfo de Penas. However, funding is still required during 2023-2024 to cover coordination compensation, coordination meetings and disentanglement training workshop in Peru. The cost for the activities not funded, based on similar activities conducted over the past 6-years, are estimated on GBP57000.

This budget don't include field work to increase photo-ID collection or collection of biopsy samples as these are expected to be covered by research institutions contributing to the CMP.

10. Other matters

The CMP coordinator thanked governmental representatives as well as Brownell, Castro and Iñiguez and acknowledge their valuable and active participation to ensure the great results obtained during the experience exchange workshop and the IV CMP coordination meeting. She especially thanked Peruvian authorities for hosting these important meetings and the great hospitality received. She also informed that she will continue to act as coordinator for the next year to ensure implementation of ongoing activities.

Representatives from Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Peru thanked the participation of each representative from Chile and Peru delegations as well as special guests from Argentina and Ecuador and the representative from IWC. They specially thanks to the work of the CMP coordinator and reiterated the commitment of Peru to continue to advance in the implementation of the CMP.

11. Review and adoption of report

The Committee agreed that the report will be reviewed by email. The report was adopted by correspondence.

Annex 1

LIST OF PARTICIPANTS

Fourth International Coordination Meeting of the Eastern South Pacific Southern Right Whale Conservation Management Plan International Whaling Commission Lima - Peru, October 05th, 2022

For Chile

Minister José Fernández, Chilean Commissioner to the International Whaling Commission, Deputy Director of the Directorate of Environment and Ocean Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Jorge Guerra Münchmeyer, Biodiversity and Aquatic Heritage Unit, Fisheries Administration Division, Undersecretariat of Fisheries and Aquaculture.

Mauricio Ulloa Encina, National Fisheries and Aquaculture Service.

For Peru

Minister Giancarlo León, Peruvian Commissioner to the International Whaling Commission, Director of Maritime Affairs, Directorate General of Sovereignty, Limits and Antarctic Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

Alejandra Paz, Directorate of Maritime Affairs, General Directorate of Sovereignty, Limits and Antarctic Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Peru.

Sara Dueñas, Directorate of Maritime Affairs, General Directorate of Sovereignty, Limits and Antarctic Affairs, Ministry of Foreign Affairs of Peru.

Rosa Ñahui, Directorate of Climate Change and Fisheries and Aquaculture Biodiversity, General Directorate of Fisheries and Aquaculture Environmental Affairs, Ministry of Production.

Jennifer Saucedo, Directorate of Policies and Planning, Vice Ministry of Fisheries and Aquaculture, Ministry of Production.

Frida Rodríguez, Directorate of Sustainable Conservation of Ecosystems and Species - General Directorate of Biological Diversity, Ministry of Environment.

Elisa Goya, Functional Area of Biodiversity Research, Instituto del Mar del Perú (IMARPE).

Regina Aguilar, Office of Top Predator Research, Instituto del Mar del Perú (IMARPE).

Lisbeth Tataje, Directorate of Environment, General Directorate of Captaincies and Coastguards (DICAPI).

Adriana Carbajal, Directorate of International Affairs and OMI Affairs, General Directorate of Captaincies and Coastguards (DICAPI).

On behalf of the International Whaling Commission

Barbara Galletti Vernazzani, Coordinator of the Eastern South Pacific Southern Right Whale Conservation Management Plan.

Robert L. Brownell Jr., coordinator of the Conservation Management Plan sub-committee of the IWC Scientific Committee.

Special guests:

Miguel Iñíguez, Alternate Commissioner of Argentina to the IWC.

Cristina Castro, director of the Pacific Whale Foundation of Ecuador.

Anexo 2

AGENDA

**Fourth International Coordination Meeting of the Eastern South Pacific Southern
Right Whale Conservation Management Plan
International Whaling Commission
Lima - Peru, October 05th, 2022**

1. Welcome
2. Appointment of chair and rapporteur
3. Review and adoption of agenda
4. Advances on short-term priority actions since 2016
5. Outcomes of the virtual expert workshop on the 6-year review of the ESP SRW CMP
6. Outcomes and recommendations of the "Workshop on Experience Exchange on Whale Watching Regulations and Research Permits"
7. Review and update of CMP priority actions for 2022-2028
8. CMP Implementation Strategy 2023-2024
9. Coordination and reporting
10. Other matters
11. Review and adoption of report